



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM

PART A:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Economics, Management & Trade
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/BJEMT/1426
Title of the Manuscript:	<i>The Link between Remittances and Economic Growth in Pakistan: A Boon to Economic Stability</i>
Manuscript received on (Date)	
Review comment submitted (Date)	



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM

PART B:		
	FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments (if any)	Author's response
For comments of Reviewer 1 and author's feed back		
For comments of Reviewer 2 and author's feed back	• Change "immigration" to "emigration", as immigration would be inflow into Pakistan. • Section 1 contains many repetitions of phrases. For example, the last sentence of footnote 2 should be omitted. • Remittances are not contained in the trade balance but in the current account balance. Omit the words "and current account deficit" on page 4. • The first line in Table 1 may show real GDP and not "Real GDP growth". Please check. • Correct typos "during the 2000 to 2010" and "GPD" on page 5. • Figure 2 should indicate the meaning of the square and diamond symbols (legend). • Figure 3 is unclear. • The references in the text are often spelled incorrectly. The references at the end of the paper are incomplete. In particular, note the spelling of "Faini", "Giuliani". "Natalia" is a given name, author's name is Catriescu. "Mellow" should read "de Mello". • Log-linear modelling cannot have a deterrent effect. • Change "Phillip-Perron" to "Phillips-Perron", and "Shcwaz" to "Schwarz". • The VAR of equation (iv) need not be attributed to Pesaran, it is standard. • Explain what you mean by representing the vector of dependent variables as a vector matrix. The wording "vector matrix" is	



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM

	unclear. • Series cannot be cointegrated of order $I(0)$ or $I(1)$, they can be integrated of order $I(0)$ or $I(1)$, or they may be cointegrated, for which some authors use notations such as $CI(1,1)$. • Change “value of the bounds test” to “value of the bounds test statistic”. • Equation (vii) should have running indices “i” as subscripts, not just “1”. • Conversely, the equation below (viii) describes a static equilibrium, the variable LY should be indexed by “t-1” not “t”. • Equation (viii) should have LY on the left, not “lnY”, in correspondence to the notation in the equation. The sentence “where ECM is an error correction term defined as” contains many typos. • Why is -4.108 starred as significant, while -4.120 is not? (Table 2) • Change “probability” to “p-value” (Table 4). • It appears that a 1% increase in remittances causes a GDP increase of 0.3% not 3%, which would also make more sense. Please check. • Note that the model reported in Table 5 uses three lags on level variables not two. Table 6 says “two lags” which may not correspond. • The graphs shown as Figure 4 always contain the axis in the confidence bands, which would indicate that all responses are insignificant. Please explain. • Among other shortcomings of the list or references, please indicate co-authors not	
--	---	--



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM

	"et al." for Kemal, i.e. ad-Din, Qadir, and Fernando. Approximately 10 references are missing entirely. I would recommend deleting unnecessary references from the text.	
For comments of Reviewer 3 and author's feed back		
For comments of Reviewer 4 and author's feed back		
For comments of Reviewer 5 and author's feed back		
For comments of Reviewer 6 and author's feed back		

Note: Anonymous Reviewer